

Paul A. Tummonds, Jr. ptummonds@goulstonstorrs.com (202) 721-1157 (tel)

> Jennifer Logan jlogan@goulstonstorrs.com (202) 721-1100 (tel)

January 25, 2019

VIA IZIS

Sharon Schellin, Secretary District of Columbia Zoning Commission 441 4th Street NW, Suite 200 Washington, DC 20001

Re:

ZC Case No. 06-10D – First Stage PUD Modification and Second-Stage PUD Application – Pre-Hearing Submission of The Morris and Gwendolyn Cafritz Foundation (the "Applicant")

Dear Chairman Hood and Members of the Commission:

On November 19, 2018, the Zoning Commission set-down the above referenced case for a public hearing. The Applicant hereby submits updated and additional information into the record in response to comments raised by the Office of Planning ("**OP**") in their report dated November 9, 2018 and the Applicant's subsequent discussions with OP and the District Department of Transportation ("**DDOT**"). This letter and attached materials also address the comments made by the Zoning Commission at the November 19, 2018 Public Meeting.

I. Updates to Project Design

Residential Component

Since the application was set-down, the Applicant and its design team have continued to review the proposed residential component of the project in order to: (i) allow for more sunlight to reach 4th Street and the adjacent Central Plaza; (ii) maximize the number of residential units that can be accommodated on Block B; and (iii) revise the residential unit mix to allow for a greater percentage of one and two bedroom units. As shown in Exhibit A, the Applicant's design team has accomplished these goals while keeping the project consistent with the vision and plans that were set-down by the Zoning Commission on November 19, 2018. These modifications are described in greater detail below and depicted in Exhibit A:

 Modifications to the Massing of the West Residential Building and the East Residential Building - Instead of a continuous façade along 4th Street with some changes in building height, the Applicant has redistributed the mass of the west residential building to create two residential towers of 80 feet connected by an amenity terrace at the second level of the building. The east residential building was previously a single-loaded corridor that was envisioned to include 30 residential units reserved for artists in three stories. The east residential building will now provide for a double-loaded corridor that will include approximately 90 residential units in five stories. A comparison of the building heights that were set-down with the revised building heights are shown in Exhibit A.

• Enhancements to the Architectural Treatment of the West and East Residential Buildings. This pre-hearing submission includes design updates for the retail and residential parts of the project that occupy either side of 4th Street, stretching between Ingraham and Kennedy Streets. The overall approach embraces a top/middle/base conceptualization although each portion is individually composed to give variety at both the street level and the skyline. Materials and colors vary per building, with the majority of the finishes in brick, pre-cast and limestone masonry with a variety of accent approaches as well. The ground level retail areas located near the intersection with Ingraham Street are developed as individual storefronts with a more unified approach to the northwest (which are coordinated with the bases of the facades above). At the midpoint of the 4th Street facade, a tower and pedestrian bridge are introduced to connect both sides of the residential program across 4th Street, as well as further animate the streetscape.

Each of the three residential blocks above the retail base are articulated differently to provide an authentic streetscape, with the southernmost block a ribbed expression with a strong cornice, the center portion a simple masonry wall with traditional "punched" openings, and the northernmost block a frame expression with industrial windows and corner balconies. A similar façade is articulated for the residential portion of the east side of 4th Street, occupying the same side of the block as the FEZ building. Façade details are provided on pp. 68-70 of Exhibit B.

• Revisions to Number and Mix of Residential Units. The total number of residential units will be adjusted from 210-250 units in the west residential building and 30 artists units in the east residential building, as proposed in the set-down materials, to a total of approximately 270 residential units. Approximately 70 units will be located in the southwest tower of the west residential building, approximately 110 units will be located in the northwest tower of the west residential building, and approximately 90 units will be located in the east residential building. The 30 residential units reserved for artists will be interspersed throughout the east and west residential buildings (but will not be located in the top two floors of the west residential building or the top floor of the east residential building.) The mix of units will be approximately 50 studio apartments, approximately 106-110 one bedroom units, and approximately 106-110 two bedroom units.

- Introduction of Amenity Terrace at Second Level of West Residential Building and Pedestrian Bridge across 4th Street. The new amenity terrace replaces the residential amenity terrace that was formerly to be located on the rooftop at approximately 4-6 stories above 4th Street. Lowering the amenity terrace to the second level allows for increased activity closer to 4th Street. The Applicant has also introduced a pedestrian bridge that will connect the east and west residential buildings above the retail podium to share amenity space. This pedestrian bridge also creates a delineation between the active public and pedestrian space along 4th Street and the loading operations that will take place on the northern end of 4th Street.
- Increase in Sunlight for 4th Street and Central Plaza. Significantly, the redistribution of the previous massing from the center of the west residential building to the two towers and the increased height and mass of the east residential building allows substantially more sunlight to reach 4th Street, particularly the Central Plaza that is adjacent to the 4th Street entrance to the Family Entertainment Zone building. A light study illustrating the sunlight that will be available to the public areas along 4th Street is provided in Exhibit A.
- West Residential Building and Remaining Riggs Plaza Apartment Building. The land area of the west residential building has been expanded to the northwest, by including land that is currently occupied by one of the remaining Riggs Plaza apartment buildings. The Applicant has been able to accomplish this as the remaining number of Riggs Plaza tenants can be relocated to the one apartment building that will remain.
- Introduction of Artist Studio Spaces on Ground Floor of Northern End of West Residential Building. In furtherance of this project's goals of creating a vibrant center for the arts, the Applicant is now proposing a series of artist studio spaces in the ground floor of the northern end of the west residential building. The Applicant envisions that these uses will be similar to the very successful Brookland Arts Walk concept. The artist studio spaces will be curated by a third-party group and will seek to achieve an appropriate mix of artists across multiple disciplines.
- Modifications to Access to the Below-Grade Parking and Loading Facilities for the West Residential Building. A new entrance/exit to the below-grade parking spaces, accessed from the public alley on the western boundary of the west residential building has been added. In addition, the loading dock for the west residential building has been enlarged to include two loading berths. These loading berths will also be accessed from the public alley to the west.

B. Family Entertainment Zone (FEZ) Building

The Applicant's vision for the development of Block B of the Art Place at Fort Totten project is to bring a unique, world-class arts and cultural destination to the Lamond Riggs and Fort Totten neighborhoods. The FEZ will provide experiential arts and education uses, arts and

entertainment programming for kids/teens/adults, quality neighborhood serving retail and dining options, and a grocery store to this community. As part of a visioning exercise that was undertaken for this project, it was determined that all of the trends and data points show that providing experiences, whether indoor or outdoor, can drive admissions, and raise the public profile and online engagement of the project. Attracting audiences, growing the membership base and remaining culturally relevant are challenges that need to be met with unique offerings and innovative programming. In a city that features dozens of free museums and world-class performing arts venues, it is imperative that the FEZ curate one-of-a-kind experiences that fortify its place in DC's cultural landscape. The revisions that are now proposed for the FEZ building are an integral factor in creating these unique experiences.

In response to issues raised by the Zoning Commission, OP and DDOT, the following modifications have been made to the FEZ building:

- Removal of Proposed Curb Cut on S. Dakota Avenue and Vehicular Entrance into the Project. The revised design shown in the materials included in Exhibit B does not include a curb cut on S. Dakota Avenue and does not propose a vehicular entrance into the project from S. Dakota Avenue. All vehicles accessing the parking provided in the FEZ building will enter the parking structure from either Ingraham Street or Kennedy Street.
- Introduction of a Mezzanine Level Adjacent to 4th Street Entrance. A mezzanine level has been introduced in the interior portion of the FEZ building adjacent to the 4th Street entrance. This mezzanine level will provide direct access from the 4th Street entrance to the interior food hall.
- Modifications to the S. Dakota Avenue Façade and Description of Lighting of the HUB. The main entrance to the FEZ building is located at the intersection of Ingraham Street and S. Dakota Avenue. The "HUB" and the five story atrium located at this main entrance are considered by the design team as the FEZ building's most important element of the public identity of the project. The design of the rest of the complex revolves around this entrance and this atrium, as it is the central distribution point for all vertical circulation. Details regarding the materials of the façade along S. Dakota Avenue are shown in pp. 65-67 of the Exhibit B.

The exterior of the HUB will be clad with a series of vertical fins that function as rain and sun screens, as shown on p. 72 of Exhibit B. The fins are formed of aluminum rectangular tubes that will result in a diffuse reflection of the sky. All lighting of these fins, and the projection of abstract art forms on the HUB will occur from below or from inside the structure. The lighting of the HUB and the fins is intended to be subtle and will not spill out past the S. Dakota Avenue right-of-way.

In addition, tri-vision panels have been integrated into a small portion of the architectural façade elements along S. Dakota Avenue. These panels create a truly kinetic façade along S. Dakota Avenue that allows a portion of the building's skin to be dynamic and active. The tri-vision panels are intended to evoke the emotions inherent in the art of the performances and the spirit of creativity that will occur inside the FEZ building. The images on the panels will be commissioned by an artist or will be reflective of events within the FEZ building. The tri-vision panels are triangular prisms that will rotate 120 degrees, in unison, on programmed intervals. Similar to the illumination of the HUB, the tri-vision panels will not emit light beyond the S. Dakota Avenue right-of-way. Additional details regarding the tri-vision panels are provided on p. 71 of Exhibit B.

- Enhancements to the Central Plaza Adjacent to the 4th Street Entrance. In order to provide truly unique and special indoor and outdoor experiences for this project, the Central Plaza area adjacent to the 4th Street entrance has been expanded to increase the amount of outdoor seating that was previously envisioned for this space. The exterior appearance of the FEZ building at this location now includes a seven-sided polygon, utilizing rustic stone piers and natural wood, which evoke the history and the ramparts of the historic Fort Totten. These materials and shape are purposefully in contrast to the modern round HUB that rises behind.
- *Increase in Number of Parking Spaces Provided.* Based on additional input from the grocer and the proposed tenants in the FEZ building and their expected parking demand, the number of parking spaces provided in the project has increased from 765 spaces to approximately 930 spaces.
- Additional Information Regarding the Loading Facilities, including the internal configuration of the Loading Facilities. Included as p. 17 of Exhibit B is a plan which depicts the loading facilities proposed for the FEZ building and the internal configuration of how those facilities will be accessed by the tenants and occupants of the FEZ building.

II. <u>Details Regarding the Proposed Uses in the Family Entertainment Zone</u> <u>Building</u>

The FEZ will include five primary components. These components are described in detail below.

• Meow Wolf. The Applicant has partnered with Meow Wolf, an innovative arts collective, to establish their first permanent installation east of the Mississippi River in the FEZ building. Meow Wolf is a unique and immersive interactive art experience, which currently hosts an installation in Santa Fe that was rated by Time Out as the #4 "Best Thing to Do in the World" in 2018. The inclusion of Meow Wolf in the FEZ will provide both District residents and visitors an opportunity to enjoy a truly distinctive and exceptional arts experience.

Meow Wolf will occupy approximately 77,000 square feet of gross floor area in the FEZ building. It is expected that Meow Wolf's hours of operation will be 10:00 AM - 8:00 PM Sunday – Thursday, and 10:00 AM - 10:00 PM on Friday and Saturdays. These hours of operation and days in which the space will be open have not been finalized and may be amended prior to Meow Wolf's opening in 2022. It is estimated that approximately 9,000 - 9,500 visitors per week will visit Meow Wolf and they will be drawn from the local community, the immediate DC Metropolitan Area and surrounding states.

- Explore! Children's Museum. The mission of Explore! Children's Museum is to create a DC based children's museum that engages children and the District at many levels and to inspire children to be curious thinkers, creators, communicators, and collaborators. In furtherance of that mission, it has hosted eight free children's festivals in the Ft. Totten area over the past two years. The Explore! Children's Museum will occupy approximately 30,000 square feet of gross floor area in the FEZ building.
- Cultural Uses and Gala Space. The FEZ building also includes approximately 95,000 square feet (approximately 83,000 square feet of gross floor area) of space that will be occupied by additional cultural uses and gala space. The gala space includes parts of the interior open and soaring spaces that are located throughout the FEZ building. It is anticipated that this space could be rented for specific events, openings, or shows.
- *Grocery Store*. The grocery store will be a full service grocery store that will occupy approximately 24,500 square feet (approximately 9,363 square feet of gross floor area). The Applicant expects to make a formal announcement of the grocery store operator prior to the public hearing.
- Retail. The FEZ building (and the ground floor of the west residential building) will include approximately 87,000 square feet (approximately 77,000 square feet of gross floor area) of retail uses. These retail uses are located along S. Dakota Avenue, the upper portion of Ingraham Street, and 4th Street. The retail uses are expected to include sitdown restaurants and a Food Hall located inside of the FEZ building (accessed from the 4th Street entrance). The Food Hall is intended to be similar in nature to the vendors that exist in Union Market, rather than the food court that exists in Union Station.

III. Response to Specific Issues/Questions Raised by the Zoning Commission, OP, and DDOT

Since the application was set-down, the Applicant has continued to meet with OP and DDOT regarding project details. The Applicant has addressed several of OP's comments and questions (italicized below) as follows:

Analysis of Block B's compliance with all zoning requirements and any relief that may be needed

• Section IV below contains a description of the requested zoning flexibility. Page 16 of Exhibit B contains a summary chart of Block B's compliance with all applicable zoning requirements.

Requests for post-approval design flexibility for Block B

• Any request for post-approval design flexibility requested by the Applicant will be consistent with such approval that has been granted by the Zoning Commission in recent PUD application approvals.

Table showing modifications to the overall approved PUD with the proposed revised Second Stage PUD for Block B

• Pages 15-16 of Exhibit B contains a summary chart of the modifications to the PUD approved in ZC Order Nos. 06-10 – 06-10C.

Submission of proposed construction management plan and evidence of discussions of plan with ANC and neighbors

• As described below in Section VI, the Applicant has been actively engaged with the Lamond Riggs Citizens Association, and ANCs 4B and 5A regarding this project. The Applicant will work with these groups on creating a construction management plan that will be submitted to the Zoning Commission in advance of the public hearing in this case.

Detailed information about the project's impacts on public facilities, services, and the environment

• The Applicant continues to prepare this information and will be able to submit this information prior to the public hearing in this case.

Breakdown of residential unit types and projected residential totals for entire PUD

• As noted above, Block B will include approximately 270 units, with approximately 180 units located in the two towers of the west building and approximately 90 units located in the east building (which will include 30 artists units mixed throughout the east building) 50 units will be studios, approximately 106-110 units will be one-bedrooms and the other 106-110 units will be two-bedrooms. The First-Stage PUD approved a total of 929 residential units across four phases. 520 units were completed as part of Block A, 270 of the 409 units that were approved for Block C are now proposed to be constructed as part of Block B. The remaining 139 units are anticipated to be constructed in a future phase of development.

Clarification of the depth and length of the subsidy for the artist housing in the East building

 Consistent with the affordable housing commitment that was approved in the original PUD approval, the artist housing units will be reserved as affordable units for a period of 20 years from the issuance of the first Certificate of Occupancy in Block B at an 80% AMI level.

Increase in affordable housing proffer

• The original PUD approval included an affordable housing requirement of 171 units. 141 of the affordable units were provided in Building A and the remaining 30 affordable units were to be provided in the development of Block C. The Applicant is now proposing that the 30 affordable units originally anticipated in Block C will be moved to Block B. Upon the delivery of the Block B residential units, affordable units in Blocks A and B of the project will account for approximately 24% of the total number of residential units.

Moreover, the Applicant believes that the principal benefits and amenities of this application, the development of Block B, are the arts and cultural uses that are provided in the FEZ building and in the artist studio spaces on the northern end of the ground floor of the west residential building. These arts and cultural uses can only be achieved through significant financial subsidy from the Applicant.

Additional design details regarding façade materials, retail frontage on South Dakota Avenue and western façade of West residential building and display frontage for the artist units

• This information is provided in the materials included in <u>Exhibit B</u> and is described above.

Clarification of green roof design

• The Applicant continues to refine its analysis of meeting both the Green Area Ratio (GAR) requirements for the project, as well as its storm water management requirements. In order to meet these requirements, the Applicant expects that the majority of the roof area for this project will require green roofs. The Applicant will have this information ready to present to OP and the Zoning Commission well in advance of the public hearing in this case.

Analysis of the impact of the Block B height increase on the view from historic Fort Totten

• In the original PUD application, the Applicant provided an analysis of the effect of a hypothetical 90 foot building with an 18.5 foot penthouse constructed as part of Block C on views from Fort Totten to Fort Slocum and Fort Bunker Hill. This analysis, attached hereto as Exhibit G, determined that a proposed 90 foot tall building would have a negligible effect on the view from the top of the hill at Fort Totten. Attached as p. 31 of Exhibit B is a depiction of the potential impact of an 80 foot tall building in Block B.

The Applicant believes that the Block B building height will have a negligible effect on the view from Fort Totten.

IV. Zoning Flexibility Requested

The only area of Zoning flexibility that the Applicant is requesting relates to a portion of the west residential building and the need for relief from the rear yard requirement. In the MU-5 Zone, a rear yard of at least 15 feet is required. For the portion of the building below 20 feet in height, that measurement can be made to the middle of an adjacent alley. As depicted on p. 30 of Exhibit B, the west residential building does not meet the rear yard requirement for the portion of the building that is located closest to Ingraham Street (approximately 150 feet) at both the retail level and the upper residential levels of the building. Obtaining this rear yard relief is necessary to create an appropriate building footprint at the important corner of Ingraham and 4th Streets that allows for a successful retail component and marketable residential floor plates above.

V. <u>Transportation Impact Study (Transportation Demand Management Plan and Loading Management Plan)</u>

The Applicant continues to work with DDOT (and OP) regarding the proper management of the transportation, loading, and operational impacts of this project. A Traffic Impact Study, which will include a Transportation Demand Management Plan and a Loading Management Plan, will be submitted to DDOT and the Zoning Commission in accordance with the relevant requirements of Subtitle Z §401.8 well in advance of the public hearing for this case.

The Transportation Demand Management and Loading Management Plans will address the number of vehicles, vans, buses, and motor coaches that are anticipated to come to the FEZ. The Applicant shares the goals that have been presented by OP and DDOT of creating a pedestrian and vehicular circulation and loading plan that is safe, effective, and appropriate for this dynamic and exciting new project.

VI. Community Outreach

The Applicant has continued to engage with the community and presented its plans for this application at an ANC 5A08 SMD Meeting on September 25, 2018, and to ABC 4B on October 22, 2018. The Applicant has also been in regular communication with the Lamond-Riggs Citizens Association ("LRCA"), a party to the original case, and has presented to the LRCA'S Development Task Force as well as the LRCA's general meeting on November 5, 2018. The Applicant has made itself available to answer questions from the ANC and the LRCA, including collaborating with LRCA leadership to disseminate key information about the project and to address frequently asked questions. Attached as Exhibit H are the Applicant's responses to approximately 50 questions that were raised by LRCA representatives and members of the community. These responses were provided prior to, and at the November 5, 2018 LRCA community meeting.

VII. Exhibits

The following exhibits are attached to this pre-hearing statement:

<u>Exhibit A</u> – Plans depicting the modifications to the residential component of the project.

Exhibit B – Updated architectural drawings, plans, and Zoning information regarding the project.

<u>Exhibit C</u> – Outline of witness testimony and resumes of proposed expert witnesses in architecture, and traffic engineering.

<u>Exhibit D</u> – Certification of Compliance with Subtitle Z §401 of the Zoning Regulations.

<u>Exhibit E</u> - Name and mailing address of all property owners within 200 feet of the Property.

 $\underline{\text{Exhibit F}}$ – Name and address of each person having a lease for all or part of any building located on the Property.

<u>Exhibit G</u> – Analysis of Impacts on Views from Ft. Totten, originally submitted as Exhibit 70D of the Original PUD Application.

<u>Exhibit H</u> – Responses to Questions Asked by LRCA and Community Members.

Exhibit I – List of Publicly Available Information.

VIII. Conclusion

The materials included in this prehearing submission address the comments and requests for additional information from OP, DDOT, and the Commission. The Applicant will continue to communicate with OP and DDOT as the public hearing date approaches regarding the additional information described herein. In addition, the Applicant will continue to meet with the LRCA, ANCs 5A and 4B, and other community organizations and groups in order to seek their support for this application.

Enclosed is the hearing fee calculator form and hearing fee in the amount of \$28,512.64 for this First-Stage PUD modification and Second-Stage PUD application. Pursuant to Subtitle Z \$1601.4(d) there is no charge for a hearing on the second stage of a two-stage PUD application. Therefore, in accordance with Subtitle Z \$1601.6, the enclosed hearing fee represents 26% of the original hearing fee of \$109,664.

The Applicant looks forward to the Office of Zoning scheduling this application for a public hearing in April 2019. Please feel free to contact the undersigned with any questions or comments regarding the information provided in this pre-hearing submission.

Sincerely,

Paul A. Tummonds, Jr.

Jennifer Logan

Enclosures

Certificate of Service

The undersigned hereby certifies that copies of the foregoing document were mailed to the following addresses on January 25, 2019.

Stephen Cochran Jennifer Steingasser (2 copies) Office of Planning 1100 4th Street, SW, Suite 650 East Washington, DC 20024

Ted Van Houghten Jonathan Rogers (2 copies) District Department of Transportation 55 M Street, SE, Fourth Floor Washington, DC 20003

ANC 5A 5171 South Dakota Avenue, NE Washington, DC 20017

Commissioner Gordon-Andrew Fletcher ANC SMD 5A08 350 Galloway Street, NE Apt 301 Washington, DC 20011

ANC 4B 6856 Eastern Avenue, NE Suite #314 Washington, DC 20012

Commissioner Tischa M. Cockrell ANC SMD 4B09 5521 Chillum Place, NE Washington, DC 20011

Lamond Riggs Citizens Association Uchenna Evans, President P.O. Box 60272 Washington, DC 20039

Paul A. Tummonds, Jr.